

Conversation Contents

My Turn: Why it's in our best interest to keep migrants alive

"Humphrey, Jeff" <[REDACTED]>

From: "Humphrey, Jeff" <[REDACTED]>
Sent: Tue May 24 2016 15:33:49 GMT-0600 (MDT)
To: Beth Ullenberg <[REDACTED]>, Sid Slone <[REDACTED]>
CC: Chris Tincher <[REDACTED]>
Subject: My Turn: Why it's in our best interest to keep migrants alive

Just FYI.

This OpEd ran in the Arizona Republic on Friday.

<http://www.azcentral.com/story/opinion/op-ed/2016/05/19/border-crossing-deaths-water-tanks/82898500/>

My Turn: Why it's in our best interest to keep migrants alive

Robin Hoover, AZ I See It 4:20 p.m. MST May 19, 2016

My Turn: Leaving water in the desert saves lives, money and the environment. But we need the federal government's help.

Robin Hoover

May 23 is the anniversary of the deaths of 14 migrants in the far west desert along the west side of the Granite Mountains. The story is memorialized in Luis Alberto Urrea's award-winning book "The Devil's Highway," and it was recently recognized by the *Arizona Daily Star* as one of the top stories originating from southern Arizona.

(Photo: By Linda Valdez, Arizona Republic)

In March 2001, Humane Borders applied for a permit to install water stations on the Cabeza Prieta National Wildlife Refuge. The permit was denied in April; weeks later, 14 migrants in a group of 26 men died. The remaining 12 required extensive medical assistance.

Border Patrol agents tracked the group's route. All 26 walked within three-quarters of a mile of one of the proposed sites (Charlie Bell Well), which would have been clearly visible for miles.

The water tank story goes international

The chief ranger at Organ Pipe Cactus National Monument and others were already advertising the water and the distinctive blue flags in Sonoyta, Sonora, Mexico. Upon retirement, a high-ranking official of the U.S. Fish and Wildlife Service said, "That wasn't our best day."

The story went international. Five film crews from five countries interviewed me at the same location in the western desert on the same day. A wrongful-death administrative complaint was filed one year later, and a \$43 million lawsuit was filed a year after that. Both events went national and international again.

VALDEZ: [Why are the feds letting immigrants die?](#)

Attorneys representing families of 12 of the deceased migrants filed the claim and the suit. The suit did not prevail because the U.S. District Court ruled that the manager of the Cabeza Prieta refuge rightfully used his discretion to deny the permit based on incompatibility.

The problem was, no compatibility study was ever conducted. It was agreed that Humane Borders would place blue flags over existing wildlife watering holes and a few above-ground tanks to help reduce migrant deaths.

15 years later, it's a best practice

The water tanks have been maintained now for 15 years without incident and no reported deleterious effects on wildlife.

Today, there are far more migrants dying than ever before in the west desert, which includes Organ Pipe Cactus National Monument, Cabeza Prieta National Wildlife Refuge, Bureau of Land Management areas and the Barry M. Goldwater Air Force Range.

SERIES: ['People are dying ... and we can't stand by'](#)

Water stations have proven to be statistically significant in reducing migrant deaths. The stations reduce county costs for health care and for medical-examiner services. They also reduce search-and-rescue operations and the destruction of natural resources.

In 2010, the U.S. Fish and Wildlife Service did conduct a compatibility study at the Buenos Aires National Wildlife Refuge, which affirmed putting above-ground water tanks marked with blue flags as a best practice. The Fish and Wildlife Service also operates the Cabeza Prieta refuge.

New challenge: Water in remote areas

The Rev. Robin Hoover

The Rev. Robin Hoover (Photo: Courtesy of Robin Hoover)

This practice has been endorsed by the Department of the Interior. All southern Arizona land managers need to seriously consider deploying even more water as the rate of migrant deaths continues to increase.

Humane Borders' tanks are located in areas that can be serviced by vehicles. Other humanitarian groups place caches of 1-gallon jugs of water in remote locations. They are not marked with flags.

RELATED: [Border water tanks vandalized](#)

As the Border Patrol has pushed migrants into more treacherous trails, the border crossers are increasingly walking in areas that cannot be serviced by vehicles, thus exponentially expanding the areas where volunteers must walk to deploy water. These operations need to continue, but additional efforts are now needed.

It's time for the federal land managers to deploy large-scale above-ground water stations, serviced by their own water trucks and clearly marked so that anyone in the

desert will have access to potable water. Such efforts would reduce deaths, costs and destruction of resources.

Migrant Status Inc. is willing to meet with all federal entities that are involved: managers, law enforcement, resource specialists and others to help place water in the desert.

The Rev. Robin Hoover is the president of Migrant Status Inc., founder and president emeritus of Humane Borders and the author of "Creating Humane Borders: A Migration Ethic." Email him at robin@robinhoover.com; follow him on Twitter, [@RevRobinHoover](https://twitter.com/RevRobinHoover).

Jeff Humphrey
Public Affairs Specialist
Fish and Wildlife Service
2321 West Royal Palm Road, Suite 103
Phoenix, Arizona 85021
<http://www.fws.gov/southwest/es/arizona/>

"Slone, Sid" <[REDACTED]>

From: "Slone, Sid" <[REDACTED]>
Sent: Tue May 24 2016 16:50:17 GMT-0600 (MDT)
To: "Humphrey, Jeff" <[REDACTED]>
CC: Beth Ullenberg <[REDACTED]>, Chris Tincher <[REDACTED]>
Subject: Re: My Turn: Why it's in our best interest to keep migrants alive

Jeff, Thank you for the OpEd piece in the Arizona Republic. He's got his facts a bit wrong. The data I recall seeing is that the folks died west of the Granite Mtns - a full 12 miles and a mountain range in between from Charlie Bell Well. Charlie Bell Well was and is a maintained water. Today we do have a "blue flag" at Charlie Bell Well per our agreement with Humane Borders. Most of the deaths during the past few years (15 last year) are occurring in the north end of Growler Valley, far closer to Charlie Bell Well than the group the author refers to. In fact we had one death last year within 1 1/2 miles from Charlie Bell Well. Per agreement with Humane Borders, we have six Refuge water developments with "blue flags". I am working on giving Humane Borders a permit to put a small water (50 gallon drum) just off the El Camino del Diablo and perhaps a few more in Childs Mountain outside designated wilderness. The big problem is, most of the Refuge is designated wilderness and to put waters where they are most needed, I would have to give Humane Borders (or others) permission to drive on administrative roads within wilderness to install and maintain the waters. As it is, we already haul water to two waters as they only consist of a 2,000 gallon storage tank each and they are in designated wilderness, requiring us to drive in wilderness every 4 to 6 weeks during the warmer months. When necessary we also haul water to other Refuge "humane blue flag waters".

More recently some of the humane groups - namely No More Deaths and the Ajo Samaritans - put out one-gallon jugs of water which contribute to trash being left in the desert. But even worse, they are now putting our protein shakes and canned foods. This is beyond saving lives, as the added food can help energize folks to hike another day or two, thus continue their journey. And unlike the deaths in 2001, almost all our illegal border crossing traffic on the Refuge is folks smuggling marijuana, not mom and pop looking for work.

Just thought I would address the OpEd piece a little FYI.

Sid

On Tue, May 24, 2016 at 2:33 PM, Humphrey, Jeff <[REDACTED]> wrote:
Just FYI.

This OpEd ran in the Arizona Republic on Friday.

<http://www.azcentral.com/story/opinion/op-ed/2016/05/19/border-crossing-deaths-water-tanks/82898500/>

My Turn: Why it's in our best interest to keep migrants alive

Robin Hoover, AZ I See It 4:20 p.m. MST May 19, 2016

My Turn: Leaving water in the desert saves lives, money and the environment. But we need the federal government's help.

Robin Hoover

May 23 is the anniversary of the deaths of 14 migrants in the far west desert along the west side of the Granite Mountains. The story is memorialized in Luis Alberto Urrea's award-winning book "The Devil's Highway," and it was recently recognized by the *Arizona Daily Star* as one of the top stories originating from southern Arizona.

(Photo: By Linda Valdez, Arizona)

Republic)

In March 2001, Humane Borders applied for a permit to install water stations on the Cabeza Prieta National Wildlife Refuge. The permit was denied in April; weeks later, 14 migrants in a group of 26 men died. The remaining 12 required extensive medical assistance.

Border Patrol agents tracked the group's route. All 26 walked within three-quarters of a mile of one of the proposed sites (Charlie Bell Well), which would have been clearly visible for miles.

The water tank story goes international

The chief ranger at Organ Pipe Cactus National Monument and others were already advertising the water and the distinctive blue flags in Sonoyta, Sonora, Mexico. Upon retirement, a high-ranking official of the U.S. Fish and Wildlife Service said, "That wasn't our best day."

The story went international. Five film crews from five countries interviewed me at the same location in the western desert on the same day. A wrongful-death administrative complaint was filed one year later, and a \$43 million lawsuit was filed a year after that. Both events went national and international again.

VALDEZ: [Why are the feds letting immigrants die?](#)

Attorneys representing families of 12 of the deceased migrants filed the claim and the suit. The suit did not prevail because the U.S. District Court ruled that the manager of the Cabeza Prieta refuge rightfully used his discretion to deny the permit based on incompatibility.

The problem was, no compatibility study was ever conducted. It was agreed that Humane Borders would place blue flags over existing wildlife watering holes and a few above-ground tanks to help reduce migrant deaths.

15 years later, it's a best practice

The water tanks have been maintained now for 15 years without incident and no reported deleterious effects on wildlife.

Today, there are far more migrants dying than ever before in the west desert, which includes Organ Pipe Cactus National Monument, Cabeza Prieta National Wildlife Refuge, Bureau of Land Management areas and the Barry M. Goldwater Air Force Range.

SERIES: ['People are dying ... and we can't stand by'](#)

Water stations have proven to be statistically significant in reducing migrant deaths. The stations reduce county costs for health care and for medical-examiner services. They also reduce search-and-rescue operations and the destruction of natural resources.

In 2010, the U.S. Fish and Wildlife Service did conduct a compatibility study at the Buenos Aires National Wildlife Refuge, which affirmed putting above-ground water tanks marked with blue flags as a best practice. The Fish and Wildlife Service also operates the Cabeza Prieta refuge.

New challenge: Water in remote areas

The Rev. Robin Hoover

The Rev. Robin Hoover (Photo: Courtesy of Robin Hoover)

This practice has been endorsed by the Department of the Interior. All southern Arizona land managers need to seriously consider deploying even more water as the rate of migrant deaths continues to increase.

Humane Borders' tanks are located in areas that can be serviced by vehicles. Other humanitarian groups place caches of 1-gallon jugs of water in remote locations. They are not marked with flags.

RELATED: [Border water tanks vandalized](#)

As the Border Patrol has pushed migrants into more treacherous trails, the border crossers are increasingly walking in areas that cannot be serviced by vehicles, thus exponentially expanding the areas where volunteers must walk to deploy water. These operations need to continue, but additional efforts are now needed.

It's time for the federal land managers to deploy large-scale above-ground water stations, serviced by their own water trucks and clearly marked so that anyone in the desert will have access to potable water. Such efforts would reduce deaths, costs and destruction of resources.

Migrant Status Inc. is willing to meet with all federal entities that are involved: managers, law enforcement, resource specialists and others to help place water in the desert.

The Rev. Robin Hoover is the president of Migrant Status Inc., founder and president emeritus of Humane Borders and the author of "Creating Humane Borders: A Migration Ethic." Email him at robin@robinhoover.com; follow him on Twitter, [@RevRobinHoover](#).

Jeff Humphrey
Public Affairs Specialist
Fish and Wildlife Service
2321 West Royal Palm Road, Suite 103
Phoenix, Arizona 85021
<http://www.fws.gov/southwest/es/arizona/>

--
Sid Slone
Manager

Cabeza Prieta NWR
1611 N. 2nd Ave.
Ajo, AZ 85321

"Slone, Sid" <[REDACTED]>

From: "Slone, Sid" <[REDACTED]>
Sent: Tue May 24 2016 16:53:21 GMT-0600 (MDT)
Brian Krukoski <[REDACTED]>, Donald Ebann <[REDACTED]>, James Atkinson

To: <[REDACTED]>, Jose Valenzuela <[REDACTED]>, Kenneth Carver
<[REDACTED]>, Kim Veverka <[REDACTED]>, Margot Bissell
<[REDACTED]>, Mary Kralovec <[REDACTED]>, Mike West
<[REDACTED]>, Patricia Compton <[REDACTED]>, Scott Crozier
<[REDACTED]>, Shawn MacGill <[REDACTED]>, Sid Slone
<[REDACTED]>

Subject: Fwd: My Turn: Why it's in our best interest to keep migrants alive

FYI

Sid

----- Forwarded message -----

From: **Slone, Sid** <[REDACTED]>
Date: Tue, May 24, 2016 at 3:50 PM
Subject: Re: My Turn: Why it's in our best interest to keep migrants alive
To: "Humphrey, Jeff" <[REDACTED]>
Cc: Beth Ullenberg <[REDACTED]>, Chris Tincher <[REDACTED]>

Jeff, Thank you for the OpEd piece in the Arizona Republic. He's got his facts a bit wrong. The data I recall seeing is that the folks died west of the Granite Mtns - a full 12 miles and a mountain range in between from Charlie Bell Well. Charlie Bell Well was and is a maintained water. Today we do have a "blue flag" at Charlie Bell Well per our agreement with Humane Borders. Most of the deaths during the past few years (15 last year) are occurring in the north end of Growler Valley, far closer to Charlie Bell Well than the group the author refers to. In fact we had one death last year within 1 1/2 miles from Charlie Bell Well. Per agreement with Humane Borders, we have six Refuge water developments with "blue flags". I am working on giving Humane Borders a permit to put a small water (50 gallon drum) just off the El Camino del Diablo and perhaps a few more in Childs Mountain outside designated wilderness. The big problem is, most of the Refuge is designated wilderness and to put waters where they are most needed, I would have to give Humane Borders (or others) permission to drive on administrative roads within wilderness to install and maintain the waters. As it is, we already haul water to two waters as they only consist of a 2,000 gallon storage tank each and they are in designated wilderness, requiring us to drive in wilderness every 4 to 6 weeks during the warmer months. When necessary we also haul water to other Refuge "humane blue flag waters".

More recently some of the humane groups - namely No More Deaths and the Ajo Samaritans - put out one-gallon jugs of water which contribute to trash being left in the desert. But even worse, they are now putting our protein shakes and canned foods. This is beyond saving lives, as the added food can help energize folks to hike another day or two, thus continue their journey. And unlike the deaths in 2001, almost all our illegal border crossing traffic on the Refuge is folks smuggling marijuana, not mom and pop looking for work.

Just thought I would address the OpEd piece a little FYI.

Sid

On Tue, May 24, 2016 at 2:33 PM, Humphrey, Jeff <[REDACTED]> wrote:
Just FYI.

This OpEd ran in the Arizona Republic on Friday.

<http://www.azcentral.com/story/opinion/op-ed/2016/05/19/border-crossing-deaths-water-tanks/82898500/>

My Turn: Why it's in our best interest to keep migrants alive

Robin Hoover, AZ I See It 4:20 p.m. MST May 19, 2016

My Turn: Leaving water in the desert saves lives, money and the environment. But we need the federal government's help.

Robin Hoover

May 23 is the anniversary of the deaths of 14 migrants in the far west desert along the west side of the Granite Mountains. The story is memorialized in Luis Alberto Urrea's award-winning book "The Devil's Highway," and it was recently recognized by the *Arizona Daily Star* as one of the top stories originating from southern Arizona.

(Photo: By Linda Valdez, Arizona Republic)

In March 2001, Humane Borders applied for a permit to install water stations on the Cabeza Prieta National Wildlife Refuge. The permit was denied in April; weeks later, 14 migrants in a group of 26 men died. The remaining 12 required extensive medical assistance.

Border Patrol agents tracked the group's route. All 26 walked within three-quarters of a mile of one of the proposed sites (Charlie Bell Well), which would have been clearly visible for miles.

The water tank story goes international

The chief ranger at Organ Pipe Cactus National Monument and others were already

advertising the water and the distinctive blue flags in Sonoyta, Sonora, Mexico. Upon retirement, a high-ranking official of the U.S. Fish and Wildlife Service said, “That wasn’t our best day.”

The story went international. Five film crews from five countries interviewed me at the same location in the western desert on the same day. A wrongful-death administrative complaint was filed one year later, and a \$43 million lawsuit was filed a year after that. Both events went national and international again.

VALDEZ: [Why are the feds letting immigrants die?](#)

Attorneys representing families of 12 of the deceased migrants filed the claim and the suit. The suit did not prevail because the U.S. District Court ruled that the manager of the Cabeza Prieta refuge rightfully used his discretion to deny the permit based on incompatibility.

The problem was, no compatibility study was ever conducted. It was agreed that Humane Borders would place blue flags over existing wildlife watering holes and a few above-ground tanks to help reduce migrant deaths.

15 years later, it's a best practice

The water tanks have been maintained now for 15 years without incident and no reported deleterious effects on wildlife.

Today, there are far more migrants dying than ever before in the west desert, which includes Organ Pipe Cactus National Monument, Cabeza Prieta National Wildlife Refuge, Bureau of Land Management areas and the Barry M. Goldwater Air Force Range.

SERIES: [‘People are dying ... and we can’t stand by’](#)

Water stations have proven to be statistically significant in reducing migrant deaths. The stations reduce county costs for health care and for medical-examiner services. They also reduce search-and-rescue operations and the destruction of natural resources.

In 2010, the U.S. Fish and Wildlife Service did conduct a compatibility study at the Buenos Aires National Wildlife Refuge, which affirmed putting above-ground water tanks marked with blue flags as a best practice. The Fish and Wildlife Service also operates the Cabeza Prieta refuge.

New challenge: Water in remote areas

The Rev. Robin Hoover

The Rev. Robin Hoover (Photo: Courtesy of Robin Hoover)

This practice has been endorsed by the Department of the Interior. All southern

Arizona land managers need to seriously consider deploying even more water as the rate of migrant deaths continues to increase.

Humane Borders' tanks are located in areas that can be serviced by vehicles. Other humanitarian groups place caches of 1-gallon jugs of water in remote locations. They are not marked with flags.

RELATED: [Border water tanks vandalized](#)

As the Border Patrol has pushed migrants into more treacherous trails, the border crossers are increasingly walking in areas that cannot be serviced by vehicles, thus exponentially expanding the areas where volunteers must walk to deploy water. These operations need to continue, but additional efforts are now needed.

It's time for the federal land managers to deploy large-scale above-ground water stations, serviced by their own water trucks and clearly marked so that anyone in the desert will have access to potable water. Such efforts would reduce deaths, costs and destruction of resources.

Migrant Status Inc. is willing to meet with all federal entities that are involved: managers, law enforcement, resource specialists and others to help place water in the desert.

The Rev. Robin Hoover is the president of Migrant Status Inc., founder and president emeritus of Humane Borders and the author of "Creating Humane Borders: A Migration Ethic." Email him at robin@robinhoover.com; follow him on Twitter, [@RevRobinHoover](#).

Jeff Humphrey
Public Affairs Specialist
Fish and Wildlife Service
2321 West Royal Palm Road, Suite 103
Phoenix, Arizona 85021

<http://www.fws.gov/southwest/es/arizona/>

--

Sid Slone
Manager

Cabeza Prieta NWR
1611 N. 2nd Ave.
Ajo, AZ 85321



--

Sid Slone
Manager

Cabeza Prieta NWR
1611 N. 2nd Ave.
Ajo, AZ 85321

